

RESOLUTION NUMBER R- 313547

DATE OF FINAL PASSAGE MAY 18 2021

A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO GRANTING THE APPEAL OF THE HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF THE HELEN BRADISH SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 328 GRAPE STREET, AND REVERSING THE DECISION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE.

WHEREAS, on September 24, 2020, the San Diego Historical Resources Board (HRB) designated the Helen Bradish Spec House #1, located at 328 Grape Street (Property), as a historical resource under HRB Criterion C as the resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Folk National Style with Neoclassical influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1908 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a pyramidal roof form with an integral front porch, wood siding with a thick cornice band below the eaves, wood windows, and a Corinthian column; and

WHEREAS, on October 1, 2020, Nexus Planning & Research, on behalf of Fenton Bankers Hill LLC, the owner of the subject Property, filed an appeal with the City Clerk, with additional materials in support of the appeal filed by Andrea Contreras Rosati, the owner's attorney, on December 3, 2020 and May 7, 2021; and

WHEREAS, on appeal, the City Council may by resolution affirm, reverse, or modify the determination of the HRB; and

WHEREAS, on appeal, the City Council may reject the HRB's designation of a property as a historical resource on the basis of factual errors in materials or information presented to the

HRB, violations of bylaws or hearing procedures by the HRB or individual member, or presentation of new information; and

WHEREAS, the matter was set for public hearing on May 18, 2021, testimony having been heard, evidence having been submitted, and the City Council having fully considered the matter and being fully advised concerning the same; and

WHEREAS, under San Diego Charter section 280(a)(2), this resolution is not subject to veto by the Mayor because this matter requires the City Council to act as a quasi-judicial body and where a public hearing was required by law implicating due process rights of individuals affected by the decision and where the City Council was required by law to consider evidence at the hearing and to make legal findings based on the evidence presented; NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, by the City Council of the City of San Diego, that the City Council adopts the following findings with respect to the HRB designation of the Helen Bradish Spec House #1, located at 328 Grape Street, as a historical resource:

1. Factual Errors – The HRB erred in designating the Property as a historical resource due to factual errors in the materials and information presented to the HRB as asserted by the appellant. Specifically, the Property is not a good example of any single recognized architectural style listed in A Field Guide to American House by V.S. McAlester (McAlester), the architectural style reference book used by the HRB. The information presented to the HRB contained factual error because McAlester does not recognize the architectural period of significance for "Folk National with Neoclassical Influences" as late as 1908 when this Property was constructed. The recognized period for Folk National architecture is 1850-1890. This Property was built outside of the period of significance for this period of architecture.

2. New Information – New information concerning the Property has been presented as asserted by the appellant. Specifically, several windows have been destroyed, the exterior walls have holes in them, and the siding is ripped off. Based on this new information, the Property does not retain the level of integrity required for designation.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, by the City Council of San Diego, that the appeal of the Helen Bradish Spec House #1, located at 328 Grape Street, is granted, the decision of the Historical Resources Board designating the Helen Bradish Spec House #1 as a historical resource is reversed, and that the Helen Bradish Spec House #1 is not designated as a historical resource.

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, City Attorney

By /s/ Lindsey H. Sebastian
Lindsey H. Sebastian
Deputy City Attorney

LJS:als:nja
05/19/21
Or. Dept: DSD
Doc. No.: 2666212

Passed by the Council of The City of San Diego on MAY 18 2021, by the following vote:

Councilmembers	Yeas	Nays	Not Present	Recused
Joe LaCava	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Jennifer Campbell	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Stephen Whitburn	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Monica Montgomery Steppe	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Marni von Wilpert	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Chris Cate	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Raul A. Campillo	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vivian Moreno	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Sean Elo-Rivera	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Date of final passage MAY 18 2021.

(Please note: When a resolution is approved by the Mayor, the date of final passage is the date the approved resolution was returned to the Office of the City Clerk.)

AUTHENTICATED BY:

TODD GLORIA
Mayor of The City of San Diego, California.

(Seal)

ELIZABETH S. MALAND
City Clerk of The City of San Diego, California.

By , Deputy

Office of the City Clerk, San Diego, California

Resolution Number R- 313517