

CITYGATE WORKING GROUP REPORT

April 13, 2011

AGENDA

- Introduction
- Priorities as Recommended by the Citygate Report
- Citygate Working Group Five-Year Implementation Plan
- Recommended Actions

INTRODUCTION

- February 16, 2011: PS&NS Committee presented Citygate Report outlining the results of a study on the fire service standards of response coverage deployment for the City's Fire-Rescue Department
- Committee voted to form a Working Group to return with a plan regarding how to best implement Citygate's recommendations.
- The Working Group consisted of PS&NS Committee Chair Marti Emerald, Councilmember David Alvarez, Fire-Rescue Chief Javier Mainar, representatives from the Offices of the Independent Budget Analyst (IBA), the City Attorney and from San Diego City Firefighters, International Association of Firefighters Local 145.

PRIORITIES AS RECOMMENDED IN THE CITYGATE REPORT

- **SHORT-TERM PRIORITY ONE:**

- Absorb the policy recommendations of this fire services study and adopt revised Fire Department performance measures to drive the deployment of fire
- Create task force to study the Fast Response Squad (FRS) concept. Bring forward an implementation pilot project and costs.

PRIORITIES AS RECOMMENDED IN THE CITYGATE REPORT

- **SHORT-TERM PRIORITY TWO:**
 - Add back brownout engines per the priority methodology used in study
 - Identify revenues to replace failing fire station alerting system to ensure timely incident notification to emergency responders
 - Identify revenue sources to increase the Department's deployment system.
 - Add additional primary engine and FRS as revenues allow.

PRIORITIES AS RECOMMENDED IN THE CITYGATE REPORT

- **LONG-TERM PRIORITY:**
 - Monitor the performance of the deployment system using adopted deployment measures and the methods in this study.

PRIORITY FIRE STATION SITES

Citygate Priority	FRS Eligible	Sites @ 5-min to 90%	Additive Population Per Gap 5-min	Additive Calls Per Gap 5-min
1	NO	Home Ave	10,271	683
2	NO	Paradise Hills (<i>Double</i>)	11,486	787
3	NO	College	6,729	403
4	NO	Skyline	19,803	1,384
5	YES	Encanto	9,715	710
6	NO	Stresemann / Governor	8,670	597
7	NO	Mission Bay / Pacific Beach	19,011	1,935
8	NO	UCSD (<i>Double</i>)	10,248	1,283
9	YES	Liberty Station	2,117	1,127
10	YES	University City	4,753	456
11	NO	Torrey	11,946	567
12	NO	Serra Mesa	15,646	1,553
13	NO	Mira Mesa	1,437	393
14	YES	East Otay	634	140
15	YES	Scripps Miramar	4,867	160
16	YES	San Pasqual	21	130
17	YES	Linda Vista	6,371	501
18	YES	Black Mountain Ranch	1,384	51
19	YES	Mission Valley	16,174	1,517
	9 FRS's	Total:	161,283	14,377

• Of these 19 sites, Citygate believes the first six are the most critical. Just these 6 sites would improve service to 66,674 residents and 4,564 delayed response time incidents. They are:

- Home Avenue
- Paradise Hills
- College
- Skyline
- Encanto
- Stresemann/Governor

PRIORITIES AS RECOMMENDED IN THE CITYGATE REPORT

- For improved ladder truck and battalion chief coverage, the geographic and workload analysis concluded that the City's Fire-Rescue system needs:
 - Four (4) additional ladder trucks
 - Two (2) additional field battalion chief units (each unit staffed by three battalion chiefs).

CITYGATE ESTIMATED OPERATING & CAPITAL COSTS

OPERATING MACRO COSTS

Resource – Staff & Operating	Cost in \$ Millions	Quantity for 5-Minute Coverage @ 90%	Totals
2-FF Fast Response Squads	1.0	9	9.0
Single engine staffed station	2.2	6	13.2
Double staffed station	4.4	4	17.6
Battalion Chief	0.53	2	1.1
Total			\$40.9

CAPITAL MACRO COSTS

Resource	Cost in \$ Millions	Quantity for 5-Minute Coverage @ 90%	Totals
Engine	0.78	10	7.8
Ladder	1.1	4	4.4
Fast Response Squad	0.4	9	3.6
Single station	7	6	42.0
Double station	8	4	32.0
Fast Response Squad Station	.5	9	4.5
Replace Fire Station Crew Alert System	3.4	-	3.4
Total			\$97.7

FIVE YEAR CITYGATE REPORT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Recommendations Carrying No Cost:

Citygate Recommendation #1- *Adopt Revised Deployment Measures:*

- *1.1 Distribution of Fire Station*
- *1.2 Multiple-Unit Effective Response Force for Serious Emergencies*

Citygate Recommendation #2- *Adopt Fire Station Location Measures, Create Revised Fire Station CIP Projects*

Citygate Recommendation #3- *Adopt Aggregate Population Definitions*

Citygate Recommendation #6- *Fire Engine Dispatch Process*

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Citygate Recommendation #4: *Near Term Deployment Options:*

- The Working Group determined that maintaining the status quo allows a less than desirable level of fire safety and that restoration of the eight browned out engines is a high priority;
- The Working Group recommends restoration of all eight browned out units in FY 2012;
- The cost of restoring all browned out units for the entirety of Fiscal Year 2012 is approximately \$11.5 million.

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Citygate Recommendation #8: Replace In-Station Alerting System (Phase I):

- The City should replace the 21-year-old fire crew in-station alerting system.
- This will improve response times via a one-time capital expense.
- The Working Group has determined that the replacement phase of the In-Station Alerting System is a top priority and should be funded in Fiscal Years 2012 and 2013, as it is anticipated that purchasing, installing and implementing the system will take approximately two years.
- Total estimated cost of the In-Station Alerting System is \$3.4 million, resulting in a cost of \$1.7 million in FY2012 and \$1.7 million in FY2013.

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Citygate Recommendation #5: Adopt the Priority Criteria of the Citygate Study for Where to Add Resources:

- 10 additional 4-firefighter staffed engine companies
- 9 new "Fast Response Squads"
- 4 additional aerial ladder trucks
- 2 additional field battalion chiefs
- The Working Group determined that the addition of these extra resources should be implemented in future Fiscal Years while the priority criteria are adopted in FY2012.

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Citygate Recommendation #7: Fast Response Squads (FRS):

- The Working Group determined that designing and implementing a pilot program for a FRS is an innovative idea that should be pursued.
- This pilot program is a potential opportunity to pursue funding via the City's marketing partnership program and it is recommended the City seek 100% of funding through a marketing partnership.
- The estimated cost of a pilot program is \$800,000-\$1 million. This cost to the City could be significantly reduced or cost neutral if it is successful in identifying a sponsor or donor for the program.
- The Working Group recommends the pilot program be placed in Encanto, which is the first FRS eligible location on the Citygate Report fire station site list.

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Purchase of Truck Company for Eastside Mission Valley Fire Station #45

- The Working Group recognized the importance of completing the construction of the Eastside Mission Valley Fire Station #45, slated for FY 2013;
- In anticipation of this fire station being constructed, \$1.1 million needs to be identified for the acquisition of a truck company;

FISCAL YEAR 2012

Citygate Fire Station Priority List: Design & Planning of Home Avenue Fire Station

- Citygate identified a list of nineteen sites for new fire stations or Fast Response Squad (FRS) deployments;
- Six locations were deemed critical;
- The Working Group recommends construction and staffing of at least five of the six sites by FY2017;
- In FY2012, it is recommended that the City fund the design and planning of Citygate's #1 priority site, Home Avenue;
- The approximate cost of the design and planning stage is \$750,000.

FISCAL YEAR 2012

FY2012 FUNDING RECOMMENDATION MATRIX

Recommendation #	Issue	Cost	Action
FY2012			
1	Adopt Revised Deployment Measures	0	Administrative
2	Adopt Fire Station Location Measures, Create Revised Fire Station CIP List	0	Administrative
3	Adopt Aggregate Population Definitions	0	Administrative
6	Review & Adopt Dispatch Processes	0	Administrative
5	Adopt the Priority Criteria of Citygate Study for Where to Add Resources	0	Administrative
7	Direct CPP to find a 100% pay partner for FRS Pilot Program. CPP to deliver 100% sponsorship. (anticipated cost \$800,000-\$1 million)	0	TBD
4	Add back the 8 browned out engines (\$1.4 M for each unit restored)	11.5 M	Council/Budget Action
8	Replace in-station alerting System (Phase I)	1.7 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Purchase of Truck Company (1.1M) for Eastside Mission Valley Fire Station	1.1 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for design & planning of Home Ave Fire station (CG #1)	.75 M	Admin/Council
	TOTAL FY2012	\$15.05 M	

FISCAL YEAR 2013

FY2013 FUNDING RECOMMENDATION MATRIX

Recommendation#	Issue	Cost	Action
FY2013			
8	Replace in-station alerting System (Phase II)	1.7 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Completion of Eastside Mission Valley Fire Station #45	3.0 M	Administrative
CWG	Funding for staffing (\$2.2M) of Eastside Mission Valley Fire Station #45	2.2M	
CWG	Funding for Construction of Home Ave Fire Station (CG #1)	8M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Capital of Engine for Home Ave Fire Station	.78M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for design & planning of Paradise Hills Fire station (#2)	.75 M	Council/Budget Action
5	Funding for Chief Battalion Unit	.53 M	Council/Budget Action
	TOTAL FY2013	\$16.96 M	

FISCAL YEAR 2014

FY2014 FUNDING RECOMMENDATION MATRIX

Recommendation#	Issue	Cost	Action
FY2014			
CWG	Completion of Home Ave Fire Station (CG #1)	0	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Staffing of Home Ave Fire Station (CG #1)	2.2 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Construction of Paradise Hills Fire station (CG #2)	8M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Capital of Engine for Paradise Hills Fire Station (CG#2)	.78 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Capital of Aerial Ladder Truck for Paradise Hills Fire Station (CG#2)	1.1 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for design & planning of College Ave Fire station (CG #3)	.75 M	Council/Budget Action
	TOTAL FY2014	\$12.83 M	

FISCAL YEAR 2015

FY2015 FUNDING RECOMMENDATION MATRIX

Recommendation#	Issue	Cost	Action
FY2015			
CWG	Completion of Construction of Paradise Hills Fire station (CG #2)	0	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Staffing of Paradise Hills Fire Station (CG #2)	4.4 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Construction of College Ave Fire station (CG #3)	8M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Capital of Engine for College Ave Fire Station (CG #3)	.78 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for design & planning of Skyline Hills Fire Station (CG #4)	.75 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding of 1 year of Fire Academy	.75M	Council/Budget Action
	TOTAL FY2015	\$14.68 M	

FISCAL YEAR 2016

FY2016 FUNDING RECOMMENDATION MATRIX

Recommendation#	Issue	Cost	Action
FY2016			
CWG	Completion of Construction of College Ave Fire Station (CG #3)	0	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Staffing of College Ave Fire Station (CG #3)	2.2 M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Capital of Engine for Skyline Hills Fire Station (CG #4)	.78M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for Construction of Skyline Hills Fire station (CG #4)	8M	Council/Budget Action
CWG	Funding for design & planning of Stresemann/Governor Fire station (CG #5)	.75 M	Council/Budget Action
	TOTAL FY2016	\$11.73 M	

FISCAL YEAR 2017 & Beyond

- Starting in FY2017 the City will still need to address a number of recommendations from the Citygate Report not achieved in FY2012-2016;
- The Working Group Recognized the need to continue implementing the Citygate recommendations and outlined the remaining actions.

FISCAL YEAR 2017 & Beyond

- **Citygate Recommendation #5: 6 Additional Staffed Engine Companies:** Upon completion the additional fire stations will require approximately \$2.2 million annually for full staffing of engine companies.
- **Citygate Recommendation #5: 3 Additional Staffed Aerial Ladder Trucks:** This will require the addition of three more aerial ladder trucks in FY2017 or later at an estimated cost of \$1.1 million each and annual staffing of \$2.2 million each.
- **Citygate Recommendation #7: 8 Additional 2 Firefighter Fast Response Squad Stations with Opening of Associated Fire Stations:** It is recommended that additional FRS are funded in conjunction with specific fire stations as recommended in the Citygate Report if the Encanto FRS pilot program is successful. The estimated cost of a FRS with full staffing is \$1.9 million.

FISCAL YEAR 2017 & Beyond

- **Citygate Working Group Recommendation: Plan for Additional Fire Stations:** In FY2017, it is recommended that the City fund the construction of one site and continue the process of constructing a new station annually until all sites have been developed. The approximate cost of the construction per year is \$8 million.
- **Funding of Future Years of Fire Academy:** As fire stations from the Citygate priority list are constructed and opened, additional staffing will be required for each. Each station will require 12-24 firefighters, and thus necessitate funding fire academies to bring new fire personnel on board.
- **Citygate Recommendation #5: Funding for Field Battalion Chief Unit:** The Citygate Report recommended two Field Battalion Chief Units. One Field Battalion Chief Unit was funded in FY2013. The Working Group recommends funding the remaining Field Battalion Chief Unit recommended by the Citygate Report.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

- The Working Group also Identified additional items that should be considered in conjunction with the Recommendations in this report.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

1. Although not included in the Citygate Report, the refurbishing/redesigning of current outdated fire stations may need to be considered in the five-year plan:
 - **Fire Station #5 (Hillcrest):** Redesign/refurbishment is estimated to cost approximately \$9,070,000, which includes the design, construction, temporary displacement, \$1,065,000 for apparatus, FF&E and public art. Total: \$10,135,000 (fully funded);
 - **Fire Station #17 (City Heights):** Redesign/refurbishment is estimated to cost approximately \$8,720,000, which includes the design, construction, temporary displacement, \$750,000 for apparatus, FF&E and public art. Total: \$9,470,000 (fully funded);
 - **Fire Station #22 (Point Loma):** Redesign/refurbishment is estimated to cost approximately \$5,638,000, which includes design, construction, temp. displacement, FF&E, public art. Total: \$5,638,000 (partially funded);
 - **Fire Station #39 (Tierrasanta):** No cost estimate available. However, for a brand new facility, the cost may be similar to Fire Station # 5 and #17.

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

2. **Bayside Station Fire Station:** This station is fully funded and scheduled to open in FY2013, however, no funding for staffing (\$4.4M) has been identified.
3. **East Village and Oceanview Hills Fire Stations:** The Working Group recommends continuing with the development of these stations as planned. East Village is funded via redevelopment and Oceanview is funded through a facility benefit assessment. Each station will require approximately \$4.4 million in staffing costs when they open.
4. **Sale of antiquated fire equipment and vehicles:** It is anticipated that as the city begins selling its older vehicles that are still operational, but outdated, additional revenue will be produced that can be used to acquire new and updated equipment.
5. **Multiple Award Construction Contracts:** In order to consolidate and minimize costs to the greatest extent possible, the City should explore the possibility of Multiple Award Construction Contract (MACC) when funding the construction of multiple fire stations.

Recommended Actions

- ✓ Adopt and Recommend City Council approval of the Resolution accepting the Citygate Report as the City's framework to address fire-rescue service deficiencies in the City, accept the Working Group's proposed Five-Year Plan to correct those deficiencies, and request the Mayor to include the Working Group's Five-Year Plan into the City's Five-Year Financial Outlook;
- ✓ That the recommendations for FY2012 in the Working Group's Five-Year Plan be incorporated into the FY2012 budget by the City Council;
- ✓ Require that on an annual basis Fire-Rescue Department update the Five-Year Plan at the beginning of each fiscal year and present the revised plan to the PS&NS Committee for approval by February 15 and the PS&NS make recommendations to the City Council, prior to April 15;
- ✓ Request that each updated Five-Year Plan be included in the Mayor's 5-Year Financial Outlook;
- ✓ Direct staff to create a revised fire station CIP list that follows the framework laid out by the Citygate Report and the Citygate Working Group's Five-Year Implementation Plan.