

# Office of the City Auditor City of San Diego

## Performance Audit of the Personnel Department

Opportunities Exist For Personnel And Hiring  
Departments To Expedite The Classified Civil Service  
Hiring Process

**Presentation to the Rules and Economic Committee  
December 11, 2013**



# Audit Objectives

- Identified and reviewed source documentation that governs the City's civil service hiring process
- Evaluated the hiring experience of a random sample of new City employees to determine the average hiring time
- Compared the City's hiring process with other public and private entities to identify successful industry practices

# Background

## January 1 - September 1, 2013

<b>Analysts Workload</b>	<b>Total (Approximate)</b>
Requests to Fill Vacancies	1,000
Candidate Applications Received	39,000
Personnel Referrals	79,000
Referrals Leading to Hires	1,400

# Background

## January 1 - September 1, 2013

Total Hiring Process Timeframe	Total	Percentage of Total
Application Submittal to Offer of Employment	280 days	
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Personnel</b> (Application Submittal to Referral)</p>	170 days	61%
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Hiring Departments</b> (Referral to Offer of Employment)</p>	110 days	39 %

# Finding 1

**Opportunities Exist for Personnel to Shorten Timeframes within Various Phases of the Hiring Process**

# Finding 1: Enhance Screening

15,466 Applications Received

15,456 Screened and Reviewed

15,014 Eligible to Complete Assessments

499 Referred

161  
Hired

9,900 of 15,014 drop out (66%)  
2,228 of 5,394 Fail Written (41%)  
2,340 of 3,267 Fail PIQ (71%)  
47 of 546 fail PAT (9%)

**Analysts' Workload: Police Recruit Position**

# Finding 1: Enhance Screening

## Refining Screening Filters

<b>Police Recruit Position</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Percentage of Total</b>	<b>Percentage Decrease</b>
Total Applications Received	15,466	--	--
Current Number of Applications Reviewed	15,456	99%	--
Using the PIQ as Initial Screening Tool	4,385	28%	72%
Using PIQ and Written Exam as Initial Screening Tools	898	17%	94%

# Finding 1: Establish Target Timeframes

<b>Hiring Phase</b>	<b>Personnel</b>
Posting Job Announcements	52 days
Assessments	75 days
Referral to Hiring Departments	53 days
Hiring Departments Interviewing and Extending Offers	110 days
<b>Total</b>	<b>Approximately 280 days</b>

# Finding 2

**Workforce Planning and Continued Predictive Recruiting are Essential for Filling High Need Positions**

# Finding 2: Workforce Planning

## City Employees Hired Since Implementation of NEOGOV (June 2011-September 2013)

Position	Number of Applicants	Number Hired	Percentage Hired
Police Recruit	15,466	161	1%
Fire Recruit	4,927	60	1%

## Years to Fill Retirement Vacancies in Non-Administrative Safety Positions

Department	Position	Retirees in Non-Administrative Positions	Current Average Hired Per Year	Years to Fill Vacancies at Current Rate	Number Needed to Fill Vacancies within 5 Years
Police	Recruit	707	69	10.2	141.4
Fire-Rescue	Recruit	279	26	10.8	55.8

# Recommendations

	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Timetable</b>
1	Personnel should create additional screening filters to increase the number of qualified applicants while simultaneously decreasing the number of less qualified candidates	Partially Agree	November 30, 2014
2	Personnel should establish overall target timeframes based on the individual phases of the hiring process including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•Length of time for posting job vacancies</li> <li>•Assessment schedules outlining target timeframes for completion</li> <li>•Length of time for Personnel to refer candidates</li> </ul>	Agree	November 30, 2014
3	Personnel should periodically evaluate and review its performance in meeting target timeframes	Agree	November 30, 2014
4	Personnel in collaboration with the Chief Operating Officer should : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•Require hiring departments to not submit Requests for Certification until actively ready to fill positions</li> <li>•Establish target timeframes for hiring departments to extend offers of employment upon receipt of referred candidates</li> </ul>	Partially Agree	November 30, 2014

# Recommendations

	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Management Response</b>	<b>Timetable</b>
5	The Chief Operating Officer should direct all applicable hiring departments to assess current and future workforce needs; the results of these assessments should be communicated to Personnel for inclusion in a workforce development plan	Agree	September 2014
6	Personnel should develop a workforce development plan, based on input from departments, that tailors predictive recruiting efforts towards high-need, hard-to-fill, and ready-to-fill positions	Agree	None given

# Recommended Action

**We ask the Audit Committee to accept and forward the report to the City Council.**