

DATE ISSUED: February 16, 2001

REPORT NO. 01-033

ATTENTION: Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee
Agenda of February 21, 2001

SUBJECT: Public Safety Ordinance

SUMMARY

Issues - 1) Should the City Council approve the outlined public safety performance based measures and goals, recognizing that they are long-term goals to be achieved incrementally based on an annual review of available funding? 2) Pursuant to the City Council's recommendation at their meeting of December 11, 2000, should the City Manager continue to include the addition of a minimum of ten public safety personnel in the annual proposed budget over the next five years?

Manager's Recommendations - 1) Approve the outlined public safety performance based measures and goals, recognizing that they are long-term goals to be achieved incrementally based on an annual review of available funding, 2) Direct the City Manager to continue to include the addition of a minimum of ten public safety personnel in the annual proposed budget over the next five years.

Other Recommendations - None.

Fiscal Impact – The fiscal impact of adding a minimum of ten public safety personnel will be calculated based on the specified classifications added. These and any additional positions will be included in the City Manager's FY 2002 proposed budget.

BACKGROUND

On May 24, 1993, the City Council enacted the Public Safety Ordinance to expand the Police Department. The City Council approved earmarking a specific percentage of the annual growth in sales and property tax and a portion of Transient Occupancy Tax (TOT) to fund the addition of police officers between FY 1994 and FY 1998. Through FY 1998, 205.00 police officer positions were added and the Police Department's budget increased from \$171.2 million annually to \$206.7 million annually. The additional resources allocated to the Police Department had a significant positive impact on the services provided by the Department. The Police Department's FY 2001 budget totals \$247,403,069.

On December 11, 2000, the City Council directed the City Manager to develop a public safety performance based plan designed to meet long-term public safety goals and to forward this plan to the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee (PS&NS) for discussion. The City Council directed that the PS&NS Committee's recommendation regarding this issue be docketed for full City Council discussion during the FY 2002 Budget Workshop.

DISCUSSION

When the original Public Safety Ordinance was enacted by the City Council in FY 1994, the Police Department was the primary beneficiary. In discussing the enactment of a new Public Safety Ordinance, the City Council has directed that a comprehensive performance based public safety plan designed to meet the City's overall public safety goals be developed.

In the past, comparisons to performance standards utilized by other cities around the country have been made in determining how successful San Diego has been in providing services to the public. Although common measures are used by several cities across the country, the basis of these measures are as different as each of the cities. Therefore, in designing a performance based public safety plan to meet the long-term goals of our city's Police and Fire and Life Safety Services Departments, it is important to consider an incremental approach that meets the unique expectations of San Diego's diverse communities and citizens.

Police Department Goals

The Police Department proposes the use of three performance measures to enable it to meet the following goals: 1) maintain or improve response times to calls for service; and 2) provide necessary pro-active time so that officers may continue to work with the community on problem solving safety projects. In order to achieve these goals, the addition of police officers is required. Increasing the number of police officers would also enable the Department to address Department and City priorities, such as preventing and responding to juvenile crime, implementing recommendations from the Use of Force Task Force, and meeting the City's traffic safety needs, without compromising delivery of basic police services.

In an effort to gauge the Department's long-term success in achieving these goals, the Police Department proposes using the number of sworn officers per one thousand population in combination with response time and pro-active time to better reflect the San Diego Police Department's overall performance. Each of these performance measure is described in more detail below.

1) Ratio of Officers per One Thousand Population

The ratio of sworn police officers per one thousand population is a common measure used to compare sworn staffing levels in other cities. The ratio of sworn officers per one thousand population measures whether a police agency is keeping pace with population increases in the community it serves. Although this measure can provide perspective, it does not take into consideration qualitative aspects of policing, such as a problem solving, as a preventative approach to fighting crime. Each city is unique in its policing needs and deployment of sworn officers. For example, many police departments use sworn staff to perform civilian job duties. Also, our Police Department has a history of using volunteers to assist officers and staff members with a myriad of tasks, including language translation, crisis intervention and victim assistance, missing person searches,

command post staffing for critical incidents, fingerprinting, traffic assistance, and safety education. Last year, the Department's 1,042 volunteers donated 199,313 hours of service. In addition, over the past several years, some police departments, including San Diego's, have invested in new technology to assist them in accomplishing their mission and goals, while others have not. The benefits gained as a result of the use of this new technology have allowed the San Diego Police Department to work more efficiently with fewer officers. The difference in the sworn officer ratio is artificially impacted when it is compared to police departments that have not invested in technology or aggressively and innovatively utilized volunteers. For these reasons, comparing staffing levels on a per capita basis alone is not a reliable performance measure of police services among cities.

.....
 The chart below reflects the number of sworn officers per one thousand population maintained by the Police Department over the last four years.

	FY 2001	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY 1998
Sworn Officers	2,074.00	2,064.00	2,053.00	2,038.00
Population*	1,277,200	1,254,300	1,224,848	1,218,700
nd	1.62	1.65	1.67	1.68

based on information from the Planning Department, Urban Analysis Section.

The Police Department has established a goal of reaching 1.70 officers per one thousand population over the next several years. As a stated goal, it allows the Department the ability to incrementally move toward it while simultaneously evaluating its impact on crime reduction.

2) **Response time**

Response time is the amount of the time elapsed from a police dispatcher's receipt of a call for service to an officer's arrival at the location of the call for service. The Department codes and dispatches calls for service by five levels of priority:

Priority E - Emergency calls involve an imminent threat to life. They are dispatched immediately. Examples include: an injured or unconscious person or officer; a traffic accident with injuries, a person threatening suicide. Response time remained at 7.0 minutes for Fiscal Year 2000 even though emergency calls for service increased from Fiscal Year 1999.

	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY 1998
Average Response Time	7.0	7.0	6.9
Calls for Service	19,660	18,802	20,181

Priority One - Priority One calls involve serious crimes in progress or a threat to life or safety. They are dispatched immediately. Examples include: robberies in progress; missing children; child abuse; domestic violence; disturbances involving weapons or violence. Response time increased to 13.0 minutes in Fiscal Year 2000, as did Priority One calls for service from Fiscal Year 1999.

	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY 1998
Average Response Time	13.0	12.2	11.5
Calls for Service	233,843	232,273	226,660

Priority Two - Priority Two calls involve less-serious crimes, with no threat to life. They are dispatched as quickly as possible. Examples include: prowlers who have left the scene; fights without weapons; a loud party with violent behavior. Response time increased to 23.4 minutes in Fiscal Year 2000.

	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY 1998
Average Response Time	23.4	22.5	23.0
Calls for Service	232,357	232,995	242,759

Priority Three - Priority Three calls involve minor crimes or requests for service that are not urgent. They are dispatched as quickly as possible. Examples include: investigating a crime in which the victim was not present, such as a burglary of a car or house; a non-violent person who is drunk in public; a loud party involving only noise. Response time decreased in Fiscal Year 2000, while Priority Three calls for service increased from Fiscal Year 1999.

	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY 1998
Average Response Time	55.0	55.4	54.2
Calls for Service	104,898	103,038	107,638

Priority Four - Priority Four calls involve minor requests for police services. They are dispatched when no higher priority calls are waiting. Examples include: found property and most parking violations. Response time decreased by almost six minutes in Fiscal Year 2000, while Priority Four calls for service increased from Fiscal Year 1999.

	FY 2000	FY 1999	FY1998
Average Response Time	62.5	68.2	65.3
Calls for Service	47,089	42,739	35,651

The Department's goals over the next several years are to maintain the FY 2000 response times for Priority E calls for service and decrease the response times for Priority 1 and Priority 2 calls for service to the FY 1999 averages of 12.2 minutes and 22.5 minutes, respectively.

3) **Pro-active Time for Problem Solving** Proactive Time for Problem Solving

Neighborhood policing encourages a problem solving partnership between citizens and police. Problem solving is the strategy used by the community and police to identify recurring incidents or matters of concern to the community. Analysis of the problem leads to a customized response, resulting in elimination or better management of the problem.

A necessary component of problem solving is pro-active, or uncommitted time, so that officers may direct their time pro-actively on projects, rather than reactively in responding only to calls for service. In FY 2000, uncommitted time was at 34.8 percent, a decrease from 35.2 percent in FY 1999, and 35.2 percent in FY 1998. Over the next five years, the goal of 40 percent pro-active time is recommended to allow for problem solving.

As reflected above, the current ratio of sworn officers per one thousand population maintained by the Department is 1.62. Increasing the Department's sworn staffing ratio to 1.70 sworn officers per one thousand population over the next several years would allow the Police Department to maintain the budgeted level of sworn officers; establish the desired high-level of patrol presence in neighborhoods; maintain acceptable response times; and, fulfill the desired level of pro-active time of 40%, enabling officers to work with the community on problem solving projects.

The following chart reflects the number of police officers needed to attain the ratio of 1.70 police officers per one thousand population by FY 2006.

Attaining 1.70 Officers Per 1,000 by FY 2006

	FY 2001	FY 2002	FY 2003	FY 2004	FY 2005	FY 2006
Population(1)	1,277,200	1,301,100	1,327,122	1,353,664	1,380,738	1,408,352
Total Officers	2,074	2,129	2,192	2,258	2,325	2,394
Officers Per 1,000	1.62	1.64	1.65	1.67	1.68	1.70
Position Additions	10	55	63	66	67	69

(1) FY 2002 population figure based on information from Planning Department, Urban Analysis Section - subsequent years estimated utilizing 2% growth per year.

When it comes to hiring new sworn personnel, the Police Department receives an average of 2,500 applications for police recruit each year. In 2000, for example, the Department received 2,030 applications. Of those, the Department hired 123.00 police recruits. So far in FY 2001, there are 77.00 Police Department recruits in various stages of training, including lateral hires from other police agencies. From start to finish, the process of selecting and training a San Diego Police Officer takes approximately 16 months. This process is completed before a new officer is placed into full patrol duties.

Fire and Life Safety Services Business Center Performance Goals

Fire and Life Safety Services Department

Fire and Life Safety Services currently operates 43 engine companies and ten truck companies out of 43 fire stations dispersed throughout the City. In addition to serving as pumpers for fighting fires, engine companies, with their assigned Fire Fighter/Paramedics, also serve as first responders for the emergency medical system. Trucks are used to carry heavier rescue tools and long aerial ladders for rescues and special fire-fighting situations.

According to the Department's computer aided dispatch system, last year engine companies were out-of-service and unable to respond to incidents for a total of 53,000 hours, which does not include time when they were responding to emergency incidents. This represents an average of over 1,200 hours for each of the 43 engine companies when they were not in their assigned stations ready for a response. The primary reasons for these periods of unavailability were:

- mechanical problems with the engines;
- out of station training, such as in-service training and multi-company drills;
- staffing related situations, such as going to a hospital to pick up a crew member who had to assist an ambulance crew; and
- other miscellaneous requirements, such as special events or community education.

This level of out-of-service time can result in delayed responses to emergency incidents when engines must respond from adjacent districts.

To address this problem, Fire and Life Safety Services proposes a performance measure based on out-of-service time. During the first year, the goal would be to significantly reduce out-of-service time and, correspondingly, the amount of time stations are vacant. To fully cover for the 53,000 hours of out-of-service time would require the equivalent of six full time engine companies.

However, Fire is proposing a two phased approach which initially focuses on reducing the major cause of out-of-service time, mechanical problems with the engines, and then addresses remaining requirements.

Last year, mechanical problems with engines accounted for 35,000 out-of-service hours.

Therefore, in the first phase, Fire proposes the addition of four Equipment Mechanic positions to enhance its preventative maintenance program and return malfunctioning apparatus to service faster.

In a second phase, Fire would add up to five engine companies over a period of time to provide backfill for companies which have to go out of service for any reason. In addition to backfill for down apparatus, additional engine companies would be used to backfill for multi-company drills, multi-battalion drills, in-service training, community education assignments, movie productions, recruit academy support, hazardous materials incidents, logistical requirements, seasonal brush fire protection, special events, and mutual aid activities. They would also be available to augment current resources during major, large scale emergencies.

Over the next several years, the Department's long-range goal is to incrementally eliminate the number of out-of-service hours. The number of additional engine companies required to

accomplish this goal would be re-evaluated annually based on the impact the addition of the four Equipment Mechanics has on the trend in the number of out-of-service hours.

The process involved in hiring new sworn fire personnel involves having recruits attend a 14-week academy, which includes Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) training and certification, familiarization with Fire operational procedures, and manipulative training using safety and training equipment carried on engines and trucks. After graduation they are certified as a Fire Fighter I and begin their one-year probationary period. During this time they rotate as regular crew members through a number of different stations and units. Upon successful completion of probation, they are advanced to classification of Fire Fighter II.

Lifeguard Division

The San Diego Lifeguard Service is tasked with ensuring public safety to users of San Diego's coastline and ocean waterways from Point Loma to La Jolla. Responsibilities include water rescue of swimmers, divers and surfers, coastal cliff rescue, medical aid, marine fire suppression, and river rescue. The area of coverage extends over 17 miles of coastal beaches, the waters of Mission Bay, and three miles offshore.

While the area of responsibility remains relatively static, several factors impact the magnitude of maintaining a safe environment; these include weather and ocean conditions, as well as attendance. Current lifeguard staffing patterns are a result of historical lessons learned since the Lifeguard Service was created in 1918.

The primary goal of the Lifeguard Service is to prevent injury or death in the areas within their jurisdiction. This is best accomplished through pro-active measures, intervening in hazardous activities before they manifest themselves in injury or death.

The Safety Index is designed to gauge the success of the Lifeguard Service in minimizing injury and death to persons visiting San Diego beaches and waterways and represents the percentage of persons who do not require emergency services each year. Emergency services include rescues and medical aids including swimmer rescue, cliff and river rescue and both minor and serious injury assistance. Since the primary role of the Lifeguard Service is prevention, the reduction in accidents is believed to be a good gauge of the success of their services. Over the next several years, the Lifeguard Service proposes increasing the Safety Index from 99.90% to 99.95%. Increasing the level of staffing can be expected, over time, to result in the reduction of injury and death and, thereby, positively impact the Safety Index. This is based on the belief that there is a direct correlation between the number of lifeguards and the number of citizens requiring emergency assistance. In an effort to achieve this performance measure goal, a staffing formula based on season of the year and intensity of use (number of beach goers) is recommended. For staffing purposes, the Lifeguard Service recognizes three seasons: summer (mid-June to Labor Day), spring/fall (spring break through mid-June and Labor Day through October 1), and winter (October 2 through spring break).

For beach use, the establishment of four categories is proposed. Category one, the highest category, would be beaches with the highest intensity of use that are guarded year-round (e.g. Ocean Beach). The second category would be beaches with moderate use that are guarded year-

round (e.g. South Pacific Beach). Third tier beaches would be those guarded daily in summer and weekends in spring and fall (e.g. Windansea). Category four beaches would be beaches with no lifeguard stationing where lifeguards respond when notified of an emergency (e.g. Sunset Cliffs).

The proposed staffing criteria, expressed in terms of lifeguard requirements for each one-tenth mile of beach, are shown in the following table. These criteria are based on the Lifeguard Service's experience with local beach and surf conditions, weather influences, beach access problems, and type of beach use.

Beach Category	Summer	Spring/Fall	Winter
	Full Time Equivalent Lifeguard Positions per 1/10 mile of beach		
One	3.13	1.56	0.56
Two	1.56	0.56	.313
Three	0.56	.313	Not Staffed
Four	.313	Not Staffed	Not Staffed

Applying these staffing criteria to the various City beaches (both ocean and bay) gives a total staffing requirement of 104.00 full-time equivalent lifeguard positions. Current budgeted staffing for these beaches is 81.00 full-time equivalent positions. Therefore, in order to reach the appropriate staffing level that will enhance the Department's ability to meet their performance goal over the next several years, 23.00 full-time equivalent positions, as well as two additional supervisor positions (Lifeguard Sergeant), would be needed to maintain their current supervisory ratio, for a total of 25.00 new positions. This would represent an average of 5.00 positions per year over a five-year period, but would be added incrementally based up the annual availability of funding.

Attaining a Safety Index of 99.95% by FY 2006

	FY 2001	FY 2002	FY 2003	FY 2004	FY 2005	FY 2006
Safety Index	99.90%	99.91%	99.92%	99.93%	99.94%	99.95%
Position Additions	6.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00	5.00

Each year the City of San Diego Lifeguard Service hires between 25.00 and 50.00 seasonal lifeguards and six to ten full-time lifeguards. Along with the majority of other lifeguard agencies in San Diego County, San Diego selects candidates who have completed the City's required pre-requisite lifeguard training through Miramar College's Regional Lifeguard Training Program. In FY 2000, of the 79 candidates who applied for the Lifeguard I position, 28 were hired. In FY 2001, nine lifeguards were promoted to the position of Lifeguard II. Once selected, a probationary Lifeguard II must complete a 190-hour advance training academy followed by a

one- year field training phase. After successful completion of the field training phase, lifeguards receive an additional 440 hours of skills training combined with extensive field training. Examples of additional training include cliff rescue, marine firefighting, boating safety and enforcement and offshore rescue boat operations.

CONCLUSION

Because the basis for measuring public safety standards used by cities around the country varies widely, an overall approach was taken and consideration given to the unique environment within which our public safety personnel perform their jobs in developing the performance measures and goals included in this report. The outlined public safety goals are long-range goals and it is recommended that an incremental approach be taken in achieving them based on available annual resources.

As referenced in this report, the amount of time it takes to complete the process of recruiting and training qualified sworn police, fire, and lifeguard personnel and the impact this has on each of the department's ability to meet the outlined goals should be considered when evaluating the overall progress and success of this performance based plan.

It is recommended that the Public Safety and Neighborhood Services Committee approve the outlined public safety performance measures and goals, recognizing that they are long-term goals to be achieved incrementally based on an annual review of available funding. Each department would have the opportunity to review and refine their measures on an annual basis based upon current conditions. In addition, it is recommended that in pursuing these goals, the City Council direct the City Manager to continue to include the addition of a minimum of ten public safety personnel in the annual proposed budget over the next five years.

ALTERNATIVE

Utilize performance measures other than those outlined in this report to measure how successful the City's public safety departments are in achieving their long-term goals.

Respectfully submitted,

P. Lamont Ewell
Assistant City Manager

EWELL/MCW