



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO
REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

DATE ISSUED: May 5, 2014 REPORT NO: 14-041

ATTENTION: Public Safety & Livable Neighborhoods Committee
Agenda of: May 14, 2014

SUBJECT: Vehicle Stop Data Cards

REQUESTED ACTION:

THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM ONLY. NO ACTION IS REQUIRED ON THE PART OF THE COMMITTEE OR THE CITY COUNCIL.

SUMMARY:

I. HISTORY

In 2000, the San Diego Police Department began to voluntarily collect vehicle stop data.

Since then, three studies were conducted by outside academic researchers using the data collected during the first two years. The academic studies were inconclusive in their findings largely because researchers were unable to accurately define the demographic composition of the San Diego driving population. Without this population data, a reliable demographic comparison does not exist.

Over time, the number of vehicle stop cards submitted by officers began to diminish. Additionally, fewer data entry staff and technical issues with electronic data routing into the database resulted in significant gaps in the data. Recent efforts have focused on improving compliance with the vehicle stop data collection requirement, consistent data entry and corrections to the electronic interface. Figures for the first quarter of 2014 statistically reflect the number of vehicle stops made by officers.

This report shows statistics compiled from the data collected during the first quarter of 2014; however, the initial obstacles related to developing an accurate comparison remain.

II. PREVIOUS REPORTS

Three studies were conducted by outside academic researchers on the data collected from the vehicle stop data cards. The first report was completed using the first six months of data collected (January-June 2000), and included 91,552 stop cards. The second report was completed after a full year of data was collected (January-December 2000), and included 168,901 stop cards. After two years of data collection (2000 and 2001), the final report expanded on the first year report, but focused on the 121,013 stop data cards submitted during 2001. The following table summarizes the data comparisons by race compiled for the three studies conducted by outside academic researchers.

**Vehicle Stop Study- Population, Cards and Searches Summary
City of San Diego**

Race	January - June 2000 Report			Annual 2000 Report			Annual 2001 Report		
	Cards	Searches	Population	Cards	Searches	Population	Cards	Searches	Population
Asian/Other	11.4%	6.3%	13.0%	11.2%	5.6%	13.0%	11.7%	5.5%	15.0%
Black	11.6%	19.6%	8.0%	11.7%	18.4%	8.0%	10.4%	16.2%	7.2%
Hispanic	28.5%	50.1%	20.2%	29.0%	51.6%	20.2%	27.7%	49.6%	22.4%
White	48.4%	24.1%	58.8%	48.1%	24.5%	58.8%	50.2%	28.7%	55.4%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Note: Population data in the two reports for 2000 represents 1998 estimates from SANDAG of persons fifteen years and older. Population data in the report for 2001 represents 2000 Census data from SANDAG of persons sixteen years and older.

III. FIRST QUARTER 2014 REPORT

The following table summarizes vehicle stops during the first quarter of 2014.

**Vehicle Stop Cards Compared to Population
City of San Diego**

Race	Counts			% of Total		
	Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population	Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population
	Cards	Searches		Cards	Searches	
Asian/Other	6,433	231	217,666	15.6%	9.1%	20.0%
Black	5,047	617	63,419	12.3%	24.3%	5.8%
Hispanic	12,460	1,005	288,651	30.3%	39.5%	26.6%
White	17,229	691	516,583	41.8%	27.2%	47.6%
Total	41,169	2,544	1,086,319	100%	100%	100%

Note: Population data represents 2012 estimates from SANDAG of persons fifteen years old and older.

The tables below are included based on community input for more in-depth comparisons including reason for stops, stops resulting in arrests and geographic breakdowns. Searches were conducted during 2,544 (6.2%) of the 41,169 traffic stops last quarter. Arrests were made during 741 (1.8%) of the traffic stops last quarter.

Vehicle Stop Card, Search and Arrest Counts Compared to Population By Division

Division	Asian/Other				Black				Hispanic				White			
	Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population		Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population		Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population		Jan-Mar 2014		2012 Population	
	Cards	Searches	Arrests	Population	Cards	Searches	Arrests	Population	Cards	Searches	Arrests	Population	Cards	Searches	Arrests	Population
Northern	561	13	10	37,473	268	19	4	3,440	605	49	22	25,673	2,647	88	56	130,299
Northeastern	1,777	35	13	63,499	312	16	2	5,184	756	38	11	18,239	2,510	56	22	91,654
Eastern	797	12	3	17,685	538	32	10	6,162	924	53	14	18,201	2,446	77	25	76,539
Southeastern	522	46	11	32,904	1,179	201	28	22,024	1,630	197	37	59,397	473	46	18	13,344
Central	481	16	9	6,605	677	70	16	6,213	1,573	150	40	32,844	1,742	63	30	34,728
Western	585	30	8	13,232	576	65	12	4,136	1,131	106	17	20,014	3,674	182	69	77,629
Southern	222	5	1	10,524	190	27	10	2,999	3,368	180	58	58,859	535	33	17	8,701
Mid City	789	63	13	20,364	1,103	179	36	12,751	1,768	191	46	51,516	1,442	100	30	46,800
Northwestern	596	7	1	15,380	111	3	0	510	412	25	4	3,908	1,451	39	21	36,889
Unknown	103	4	1	0	93	5	4	0	293	16	8	0	309	7	4	0
Total	6,433	231	70	217,666	5,047	617	122	63,419	12,460	1,005	257	288,651	17,229	691	292	516,583

Note: Population data represents 2012 estimates from SANDAG of persons fifteen years old and older.

Vehicle Stop Card, Search and Arrest Percentages Compared to Population By Division

Division	Asian/Other			Black			Hispanic			White		
	Jan-Mar 2012 Cards	Jan-Mar 2012 Searches	Jan-Mar 2012 Arrests	Jan-Mar 2012 Cards	Jan-Mar 2012 Searches	Jan-Mar 2012 Arrests	Jan-Mar 2012 Cards	Jan-Mar 2012 Searches	Jan-Mar 2012 Arrests	Jan-Mar 2012 Cards	Jan-Mar 2012 Searches	Jan-Mar 2012 Arrests
Northern	13.7%	7.7%	10.9%	6.6%	11.2%	4.3%	14.8%	29.0%	23.9%	64.9%	52.1%	60.9%
Northeastern	33.2%	24.1%	27.1%	5.8%	11.0%	4.2%	14.1%	26.2%	22.9%	46.9%	38.6%	45.8%
Eastern	16.9%	6.9%	5.8%	11.4%	18.4%	19.2%	19.6%	30.5%	26.9%	52.0%	44.3%	48.1%
Southeastern	13.7%	9.4%	11.7%	31.0%	41.0%	29.8%	42.8%	40.2%	39.4%	12.4%	9.4%	19.1%
Central	10.8%	5.4%	9.5%	15.1%	23.4%	16.8%	35.2%	50.2%	42.1%	38.9%	21.1%	31.6%
Western	9.8%	7.8%	7.5%	9.7%	17.0%	11.3%	19.0%	27.7%	16.0%	61.6%	47.5%	65.1%
Southern	5.1%	2.0%	1.2%	4.4%	11.0%	11.6%	78.1%	73.5%	67.4%	12.4%	13.5%	19.8%
Mid City	15.5%	11.8%	10.4%	21.6%	33.6%	28.8%	34.7%	35.8%	36.8%	28.3%	18.8%	24.0%
Northwestern	23.2%	9.5%	3.8%	4.3%	4.1%	0.0%	16.0%	33.8%	15.4%	56.5%	52.7%	80.8%
Unknown	12.9%	12.5%	5.9%	11.7%	15.6%	23.5%	36.7%	50.0%	47.1%	38.7%	21.9%	23.5%
City-Wide	15.6%	9.1%	9.4%	12.3%	24.3%	16.5%	30.3%	39.5%	34.7%	41.8%	27.2%	39.4%

Note: Population data represents 2012 estimates from SANDAG of persons fifteen years old and older.

**Reason for Vehicle Stop
Count By Division**

Division	Moving Violation	Equipment Violation	Radio Call/ Citizen Contact	Personal Knowledge / Informant	Suspect Information	Municipal, County, H&S Code	Unknown
Northern	3,182	754	64	15	11	51	4
Northeastern	3,887	1,381	39	14	11	20	3
Eastern	3,415	1,203	37	11	7	29	3
Southeastern	2,057	1,662	27	14	15	29	0
Central	3,334	1,080	16	10	10	19	4
Western	4,921	871	62	8	6	70	28
Southern	2,925	1,282	22	29	5	52	0
Mid City	3,036	1,925	66	12	22	39	2
Northwestern	2,088	1,010	17	3	5	6	1
Unknown	204	11	0	0	1	0	22
TOTAL	29,049	11,179	350	116	93	315	67

**Reason for Vehicle Stop
Percent By Division**

Division	Moving Violation	Equipment Violation	Radio Call/ Citizen Contact	Personal Knowledge / Informant	Suspect Information	Municipal, County, H&S Code	Unknown
Northern	78.0%	18.5%	1.6%	0.4%	0.3%	1.2%	0.1%
Northeastern	72.6%	25.8%	0.7%	0.3%	0.2%	0.4%	0.1%
Eastern	72.6%	25.6%	0.8%	0.2%	0.1%	0.6%	0.1%
Southeastern	54.1%	43.7%	0.7%	0.4%	0.4%	0.8%	0.0%
Central	74.5%	24.1%	0.4%	0.2%	0.2%	0.4%	0.1%
Western	82.5%	14.6%	1.0%	0.1%	0.1%	1.2%	0.5%
Southern	67.8%	29.7%	0.5%	0.7%	0.1%	1.2%	0.0%
Mid City	59.5%	37.7%	1.3%	0.2%	0.4%	0.8%	0.0%
Northwestern	66.7%	32.3%	0.5%	0.1%	0.2%	0.2%	0.0%
Unknown	85.7%	4.6%	0.0%	0.0%	0.4%	0.0%	9.2%
City-Wide	70.6%	27.2%	0.9%	0.3%	0.2%	0.8%	0.2%

IV. DEMOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION OF DRIVERS

As stated in previous reports by outside researchers, the primary challenge in analyzing vehicle stop data stems from the difficulty in determining the composition of San Diego's driving population. Some of the analysis, results and observations discussed in the previous reports indicate that data collection provides a unique opportunity to answer questions and break new ground in problem solving and community policing. However, there are difficulties in analyzing the data because there is no precise way to determine comparison demographics of the driving population.

For this reason, over a decade ago the outside independent researchers reported inconclusive results; a problem that continues today. Although cities often use population figures as an estimated comparison, this is particularly challenging in San Diego, with its proximity to the border, designation as a world tourist destination, major military presence, and other factors not considered in population data. Other issues include varied access to vehicles, transit ridership, commuters to and from other cities in the region, and individual travel patterns within the city for work or recreation.

The Department of Homeland Security estimated the number of persons crossing the international border during 2012 was more than 43 million. During 2012, over 11.5 million vehicles crossed northbound at the San Ysidro Port of Entry and 6.1 million vehicles crossed northbound at the Otay Mesa Port of Entry.

The San Diego Tourism Authority reported that during 2012, San Diego had more than 32 million visitors. Airport and rail arrivals totaled more than 9 million, including City residents returning from out of town travel. Some portion of air and rail travelers rent vehicles during their visit, adding to the San Diego driving population.

Non-population comparisons, such as driver's license information, were considered; however the California driver's license record does not contain ethnicity information. Despite identified challenges, 2012 population data for City of San Diego residents over the age of fifteen was used, since resident population data, including ethnicity, race and age, is readily available. Children under the age of fifteen were excluded as not likely to be part of the driving population.

V. CONCLUSION

Figures for the first quarter of 2014 statistically reflect the number of vehicle stops made by officers. The number of cards completed should exceed the number of issued citations, since some motorists receive a verbal or written traffic warning in lieu of a citation. This quarter there were 157% of cards to citations.

Previous academic studies were inconclusive in their findings largely because researchers were unable to accurately define the demographic composition of the San Diego driving population. As stated by the researchers in the 2001 report, "It cannot be determined with any confidence whether the data indicate any systematic patterns of bias in vehicle stops or searches." Without

the driving population data, a reliable demographic benchmark does not exist, and analysis of exact comparisons continues to be difficult.

The San Diego Police Department is absolutely committed to the fair treatment of all members of our community. Building and sustaining trust is essential to furthering our Department's Mission and Vision. The Department's Vision emphasizes the importance of working together in community partnerships to be a model of excellence in policing and fostering the highest level of public trust and safety. To that end, the San Diego Police Department will continue to collect data on vehicle stops.

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Shelley Zimmerman", followed by a horizontal line.

Shelley Zimmerman
Chief of Police