



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the City Council

DATE ISSUED: July 20, 2017

REPORT NO: 17-045

ATTENTION: Honorable Council President Myrtle Cole and Members of the City Council

SUBJECT: Fiscal Year 2016 Balboa Park Amenity Condition Assessment Report and Proposed Service Level

REQUESTED ACTION:

This is an information item only.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

This is a report on the results of a Balboa Park park amenity condition assessment conducted in Fiscal Year 2016. While staff has no recommendations at this time, service level projections are included in this report.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF ITEM BACKGROUND:

In December 2013, City Council authorized (by Resolution No. R-308581) the award of three Facilities Condition Assessment (FCA) consultant agreements for the purpose of assessing the condition of City's facilities. Each of the three agreements was authorized for a maximum contract value of \$5 million and up to 5 years. Through the annual budget process, the City Council has approved an allocation of \$300,000 per year from Fiscal Year (FY) 2014 through FY 2020 for park amenity condition assessments.

The Park Condition Assessment (PCA) program focuses on the developed acreage within the developed parks where infrastructure has been built or installed that is utilized by the public. This infrastructure deteriorates over time and requires operations, maintenance and capital replacement expenditures to maintain a desired service level within the park system. The methodology and process for the PCA program is provided in Report to Council #17-028. Recently, the consultant completed the PCA for Balboa Park.

In FY2016, 416 acres of Balboa Park's developed park areas were assessed. The assessment was divided into the three commonly recognized areas of the park, the West Mesa (84 acres), Central Mesa (185 acres), and the East Mesa (147 acres). The open space canyons within the park's boundary and leased areas such as the Japanese Friendship Garden and the San Diego Zoo are not included in the 416 acres assessed. This PCA report does not include the building facilities within the park as

those were performed under a separate contract managed by the Public Works Department. A companion Report to Council #16-105 describes the facilities condition assessment for Balboa Park. The PCA also does not include:

- a. Irrigation systems within the park
- b. Underground utilities such as water mains, sewer mains, electrical systems
- c. Proposed improvements listed in the 2008 Soul of San Diego Report
- d. Proposed improvements included in the Balboa Park Master or Precise Plans
- e. Seismic retrofits of older buildings such as the Museum of Man and the Museum of Art
- f. Tenant improvements for facilities

The assessment includes the sewer laterals and storm drains in the Central Mesa area of Balboa Park.

The PCA is a visual assessment of the park assets that are outside and visually apparent above the ground. The following table lists the park assets included in the PCA.

Assets within the Park Included in the Assessments	
Playgrounds	Park Furnishings
Landscaping	Fences and Walls
Above-Ground Storm Water Devices	Pedestrian Paving
Playing Fields	Parking Lots
Outdoor Courts	Park Roads

PCA Balboa Park Process

Each area of Balboa Park, West, Central, and East Mesas were visited by a team of assessment professionals using checklists to ensure each asset type was captured in the assessment. During the park site visits, each asset type listed above was inventoried and evaluated for repairs and remaining useful life. The remaining useful life is based on industry standard lifecycle charts and the consultant’s professional experience. The inventory information along with the repairs and remaining useful life for each asset type were used to estimate the maintenance and capital backlog and to project future capital renewal costs over a 20-year period.

A detailed report was generated for each park area assessed as well as the cumulative summary report attached to this report (Attachment A, Park Amenity Assessment: Balboa Park Cumulative Report, dated June 30, 2016). The report outlines the immediate maintenance and capital needs within the park as well as the projected costs associated with each asset type and the year major maintenance or replacement is necessary over the 20-year period. The projected costs in the 20-year outlook assumes the immediate maintenance and replacement needs were performed in the fiscal year the park was assessed. For example, when the

assessment conducted in FY 2016 indicated a playground needed to be replaced, the 20-year outlook shows the playground being replaced again at the end of its 15-year useful life, or in 2031.

It is important to note that the repair or replacement costs shown in the individual park areas assessment reports and cumulative summary report only reflect the repair or replacement of the existing asset. Similar to the condition assessments for facilities, these costs do not reflect expansions, upgrades, or improvements to the asset.

Park Condition Index Summary

The following table provides the average Park Condition Index (PCI) for the three park areas within Balboa Park.¹ The average PCI rating is an average of the park areas assessed. Balboa Park overall averaged a PCI of 5 which places it at the high end of the good category.

Park Areas within Balboa Park	FY Year Assessed	Acres Assessed FY16	PCI	Avg. PCI Condition Rating¹
West Mesa	2016	84	8	Good
Central Mesa	2016	185	4	Good
East Mesa	2016	147	3	Good
Totals	2016	416	Ave. 5	Good

Reliability Levels:¹

In Balboa Park the facilities and buildings associated with the various museums and institutions are a key factor in the overall success of the park. However, this report is focused on the park amenities as identified below. The buildings were assessed under a separate assessment effort.

Reliability Levels by Park Subsystem

Reliability Level 1 Operations Impacts	Reliability Level 2 Deterioration	Reliability Level 3 Appearance
Playgrounds	Parking Lots	Landscaping
Athletic Fields	Park Roads	Park Furnishings
Pedestrian Walkways	Above-Ground Stormwater Devices	Fences
Outdoor Courts		Signage

It is important to address critical deficiencies in the Level 1 Operations Impacts followed by the Level 2 Deterioration subsystems and Level 3 Appearance to ensure usability of the park.

¹ For a complete description of PCI and reliability levels, please see Report to Council #17-028.

July 20, 2017

The table below summarizes the estimated backlog by Reliability Level for the three areas within Balboa Park. Completing all of the backlog for existing facilities indicated in the table below is not industry Best Management Practice and is not a recommended service level. The purpose of this table is to characterize the backlog so that a service level can be established that addresses the most critical systems to maintain safety and operations.

Park Areas within Balboa Park	Acres Assessed	Level 1 Operations Impacts	Level 2 Deterioration	Level 3 Appearance	Total Backlog
West Mesa	84	\$1.32M	\$2.17M	\$33K	3.53M
Central Mesa	185	\$1.89M	\$3.83M	\$22K	5.74M
East Mesa	147	\$1.55M	\$885K	\$16K	2.45M
Total Parks	416	\$4.76M	\$6.8M	\$71K	11.72M

Proposed Service Level for Balboa Park:

Since the methodology to derive Balboa Park's PCI service level score is similar to deriving a building's Facilities Condition Index (FCI) score, staff in consultation with the assessment professionals determined that the same service level could be used for both PCI and FCI. A proposed PCI goal of 15 is consistent with the FCA program proposed FCI goal of 15 for public buildings. The FCA program proposed the FCI goal of 20 for city offices and sheds on developed parks since these types of buildings do not serve a public use. An FCI of 20 is still in good condition, just not quite as good as the public use buildings with an FCI of 15. Using the same service level goal for parks and the public use buildings within those parks ensures the total reinvestment calculation is consistent for both assets. It also ensures that park facilities are weighted equally to address the different users of that park. Some users may rate a recreation center as being the most important asset within a park while other users may rate an athletic field as being more important. Weighting these very different assets equally provides a holistic approach to managing the city's park assets.

Balboa Park has an average PCI of 5, therefore, Balboa Park's park amenities (which excludes facilities and buildings) do not need additional reinvestment because they already exceed the goal PCI of 15. That is not to say some maintenance and capital backlogs within the park do not need to be addressed, it simply means Balboa Park currently exceeds a PCI goal of 15 and it rated by this methodology as being in good condition. The average Balboa Park PCI of 5 is for 2016. PCI's increase over time due to deterioration of the park assets. Therefore, additional funding will be required to maintain the goal PCI's over time as assets deteriorate and reach the end of their useful life.

Attachment B provides a list of projects accomplished over the past few years and a list of projects underway within Balboa Park. These projects encompass those provided through the City's Capital Improvement Program, philanthropic donations, and those undertaken by other various entities and volunteers. These completed and current projects are one of the reasons why Balboa Park has an average PCI of 5, well above the recommended PCI goal of 15 for the City's overall park system.

Combined Results for PCA Park Assets and FCA Buildings within Parks

To determine the necessary reinvestment amount for a particular park which includes the site assets and the buildings, the PCA data can be combined with the FCA data. The FCA and PCA were completed with the same methodology, but by different consultants. The following chart provides the necessary reinvestment when the park building FCA data is combined with the park assets PCA data for Balboa Park.

Proposed Service Level for Developed Parks (site assets and buildings)				
Park	Balboa Park Buildings: Reinvestment for FCI 15/20	Balboa Park Other Park Amenities: Reinvestment for PCI 15	Max. GOAL FCI	Total Necessary Reinvestment to Obtain a FCI/PCI of 15/20 for Balboa Park
Balboa Park	\$79.2M	\$0	15/20 Good	\$79.2M

Achieving a proposed service level of 15 requires a reinvestment of \$79.2M for Balboa Park to improve the average PCI/FCI to 15/20 Good with a maximum FCI for each building of FCI 15 - Good for City-occupied and leased public/semi-public and FCI 20 - Good for City-occupied and leased offices/work yards/operations and commercial/residential facilities. The average PCI/FCI's reported are for 2016 and the PCI/FCI's increase over time due to deterioration of the asset sub-systems.

SUMMARY:

In Fiscal Year 2016, the site amenities within 416 acres of developed parkland within Balboa Park were assessed to determine the overall condition of the park. In addition, 118 buildings or structures within the park were assessed under a separate condition assessment contract.

The true value of the assessment reports generated for each area within Balboa Park lies in how the data can be used to develop a long-term asset management plan to assist the future maintenance and management of the park. An important first step in any asset management plan is to identify the assets owned, where those assets are located, and the condition of those assets.

Both the developed park amenity condition assessments and the facilities condition assessments were assigned a Park Condition Index and Facility Condition Index service level goal of 15 which is good condition (PCI/FCI of 0 to 20 is good condition). The service level PCI/FCI goal is then used to calculate the necessary reinvestment to bring the outdoor park assets and park buildings to the service level goal of 15. Based on these calculations, no reinvestment is necessary for the park assets and \$79.2M of reinvestment is needed for the buildings and structures within the park. The necessary reinvestment amounts do not include future capital renewal, improvements, expansion, or upgrades.

The \$79.2M is in 2016 dollars and will increase in time due to inflation and due to continuing deterioration of the park assets. The condition assessment data and the proposed reinvestment amounts are a snapshot in time that provide valuable information on the current condition of park assets and the costs associated with maintaining and replacing those assets over time. This condition assessment data along with a mission-specific business model will be used in developing a city-wide asset management plan that will help the City make the most effective use of its resources.

CITY STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL(S)/OBJECTIVES:

Goal # 1: Provide high quality public service

Objective #1: Promote a customer-focused culture that prizes accessible, consistent, and predictable delivery of services

Goal #2: Work in partnership with all of our communities to achieve safe and livable neighborhoods

Objective #3: Invest in infrastructure

Objective #4: Foster services that improve quality of life

Goal #3: Create and sustain a resilient and economically prosperous City

Objective #1: Create dynamic neighborhoods that incorporate mobility, connectivity and sustainability

FISCAL CONSIDERATIONS:

None, this is an information report only.

EQUAL OPPORTUNITY CONTRACTING INFORMATION (if applicable): N/A

PREVIOUS COUNCIL and/or COMMITTEE ACTIONS:

City Council 12/9/2013 Resolution 308581; FCA Consultant Contracts

Infrastructure Committee 1/21/2015; FY 2016 – 2020 Consolidated Multi-Year Capital Planning Report

Infrastructure Committee 6/3/2015; FY14 Facilities Condition Assessment Update

City Council 7/13/2015; FY14 Facilities Condition Assessment Update

Infrastructure Committee 12/9/2015; FY17 – FY21 Five-year Capital Infrastructure Planning Outlook

Infrastructure Committee 3/16/2016; FY16 Facilities Condition Assessment Update

City Council 4/12/2016; FY16 Facilities Condition Assessment Update

Infrastructure Committee 12/7/2016; FY16 General Fund Leased Facilities Condition Assessment Update

City Council 3/14/2017; FY16 General Fund Leased Facilities Condition Assessment Update

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION AND OUTREACH EFFORTS:

Presentation to the Park and Recreation Board on March 16, 2017. Presentation included assessment results of 76 parks, including Balboa Park.

KEY STAKEHOLDERS AND PROJECTED IMPACTS:

Key stakeholders include City of San Diego residents, park advocacy groups, park advisory groups, institutions and museums, and visitors.

Respectfully Submitted,



Herman D. Parker
Director
Park and Recreation Department



David Graham
Deputy Chief Operating Officer
Neighborhood Services

Attachments:

- A. Park Amenity Assessment Balboa Park Cumulative Report, June 30, 2016
- B. Balboa Park Project List